

EDMONTON PUBLIC SCHOOLS

May 9, 2006

TO: Board of Trustees

FROM: E. Schmidt, Acting Superintendent of Schools

SUBJECT: Student Transportation Carrier Contracts 2006-2009

ORIGINATOR: C. McCabe, Executive Director

RESOURCE
STAFF: Jenise Bidulock, Mark Gratton, Dorothy Sombach, Kelly Hehn,
Richard Coish, Michelle Tymchuk, Rob Rutteman

RECOMMENDATION

1. That the transportation proposals for fixed and kindergarten noon routes for the 2006-2007, 2007-2008, 2008-2009 school years with the following carriers, be approved:
Briggs Bros. Student Transportation
Cunningham Transport (1986) Ltd.
Golden Arrow School School Buses Ltd.
Laidlaw Education Services
Red Arrow
2. That the transportation proposals for special needs transportation service for the 2006-2007, 2007-2008, 2008-2009 school years with the following carriers, be approved:
Briggs Bros. Student Transportation
Red Arrow

* * * * *

Background

Board policy, EEA.BP Student Transportation Services, states that public proposals for the provision of charter bus service for district students are to be called at least every three years. The last call for proposals was in May 2003. The administration issued a request for proposals on March 29, 2006 for the provision of charter yellow bus services for the 2006-2007, 2007-2008, 2008-2009 school years. The closing date for receipt of the proposals was 2:00 p.m. on April 18, 2006.

The guiding principle throughout the call for proposals was to achieve competitive prices based on volume discounts while ensuring that district students continue to be provided with safe, efficient and reliable transportation. The criteria and weighting used for evaluating proposals are as follows:

- A weighting of 30 per cent was used for tender price which reflected price discounts based on volume.
- A weighting of 15 per cent was used to evaluate the vendor's preventative maintenance program and ability to effectively manage and perform the volume of work.
- A weighting of 20 per cent was used to evaluate the continuity of service to students and to ensure the district's best interest in the long-term to maintain a healthy competitive market.
- A weighting of 15 per cent was used to evaluate staff and safety training programs.
- A weighting of 15 per cent was used to evaluate the vendor's technology plan.
- A weighting of 5 per cent was used to evaluate the vendor's company profile.

Results of the Call for Proposals

A pre-qualification for new school bus carriers interested in providing charter bus services for the district was advertised on "Alberta Purchasing Connection". The purpose was to invite new carriers not presently serving the district to the process and to ensure that they met the mandatory requirements in order to pre-qualify for the opportunity to submit a bid. A total of six vendors pre-qualified and submitted bids for the three year term. School bus carriers pre-qualifying with the district were requested to provide an overview of their preventative maintenance program, their staff and safety training programs and their technology plan, along with their bid. This information was taken into consideration when proposals were evaluated and recommendations made to award contracts

Five proposals were received from carriers currently under contract to the district for the provision of charter bus service. One proposal was received from a carrier currently not under contract to the district but pre-qualified and submitted a bid. Two of the carriers submitted proposals for fixed route service only, two carriers submitted proposals for portions of both fixed route service and special needs transportation service. One new carrier submitted a proposal for all categories of yellow bus service.

The total expenditure for charter yellow bus service for 2006-2007 based on the administration's recommendation is estimated to be \$17,200,000 including GST (Appendix I & II). This represents a \$1,400,000 increase or 9 per cent over the current school year total projected expenditure of \$15,800,000 for charter yellow bus service. The 9 per cent reflects an increase in the rate by the carriers for all categories of yellow bus service. This increase is in part due to the level of service outlined in the Request for Proposals which included a minimum driver salary and a basic fuel price of \$.85 per litre for diesel fuel. It is anticipated that the minimum driver salary will address the severe driver shortage the district experienced in the current school year. The current basic fuel price included in the daily rate is \$.52 per litre and the recommendation is to increase the base amount to \$.85 per litre for diesel fuel.

As a result of intensive negotiations with the carriers, this increase has been negotiated down by approximately \$300,000.

The number of vehicles and transported students are approximations and may vary depending on the number of students requiring the service. The actual number of contracted vehicles and transported students will be adjusted by administration as required.

1. Fixed Route Service

Each of the proposals for fixed route service was evaluated against the established criteria. Hertz Northern Bus Lines was not awarded a portion of the contract because of the district's inexperience with this carrier and lack of information from the contractor on setting up a new location in the Edmonton area.

Cost savings of approximately \$500,000 could have been achieved by awarding a larger number of fixed routes to only two carriers with the lowest price, one of which was the carrier not awarded any part of the contract, and the other could provide a maximum of ten buses. The recommended mix of carriers provides a competitive and healthy environment which will maximize the district's flexibility to respond to changing circumstances in the future. It is also advantageous to maintain a competitive market rather than take advantage of short-term savings and possibly create a monopoly situation in the long term.

2. Special Needs Service

Each of the proposals for special needs transportation service was evaluated against the established criteria. Based on the cost savings to the district and the importance of continuity of service to students in need of special education programs, the administration is recommending that Briggs Bros. Student Transportation Ltd. and Red Arrow Express Ltd. be awarded the same portions of the special needs contract that they are currently serving.

The district will be introducing a new category of transportation for students with mild/moderate disabilities. Curb service for some Literacy and Strategies students will be discontinued commencing with the 2006-2007 school year. These students will be part of a pilot project to transport them on a special needs fixed route with safe designated stops located on the main arteries. Principals will be consulted on the capability of the students before they are moved to the fixed route concept. This initiative could result in a \$200,000 saving and a reduction in ride time for students.

DS:mo

- APPENDIX I 2005 -2006 Actual and 2006-2007 Proposed Fixed & Kindergarten Noon Charter Bus Service Expenditures
- APPENDIX II 2005-2006 Actual and 2006-2007 Proposed Special Needs Charter Bus Service Expenditures

**2005-2006 ACTUAL AND 2006-2007 PROPOSED
FIXED AND KINDERGARTEN NOON CHARTER BUS SERVICE EXPENDITURES**

Carriers	2005-2006 Actual Rates			2006-2007 Proposed Rates			
	Daily * Rates	Number of Routes	Annual Cost (191 Days) **	Daily * Rates	Per Cent Change	Projected No. of Routes	Projected Annual Cost (191 Days)
BRIGGS:							
AM/PM Routes	\$162.48	26	\$806,875.68	\$191.50	17.9	30	\$1,097,295.00
Prince Charles (Awasis)	\$211.42	6	\$242,287.32	\$247.37	17.0	6	\$283,486.02
Noon Routes	\$50.90	9	\$87,497.10	\$59.55	17.0	15	\$170,610.75
CUNNINGHAM							
AM/PM Routes	\$148.42	6	\$170,089.32	\$180.00	21.3	10	\$343,800.00
Noon Routes	\$42.42	5	\$40,511.10	\$52.00	22.6	7	\$69,524.00
GOLDEN ARROW:							
AM/PM Routes	\$158.81	38	\$1,152,642.98	\$189.50	19.3	45	\$1,628,752.50
Noon Routes	\$57.27	25	\$273,464.25	\$71.50	24.8	30	\$409,695.00
LIDLAW:							
AM/PM Routes	\$158.01	30	\$905,397.30	\$195.00	23.4	39	\$1,452,555.00
Noon Routes	\$52.69	15	\$150,956.85	\$69.00	31.0	18	\$237,222.00
RED ARROW:							
AM/PM Routes	\$163.26	34	\$1,060,210.44	\$204.75	25.4	10	\$391,072.50
Noon Routes	\$54.51	19	\$197,816.79	\$74.68	37.0	3	\$42,791.64
CCEP AM/PM Routes	\$168.57	5.5	\$177,082.79	\$219.21	30.0	5.5	\$230,280.11
CCEP Options Per Trip	\$36.06	1775	\$64,006.50	\$46.50	29.0	1775	\$82,537.50
AM/PM Routes		134	\$ 4,095,215.72	AM/PM Routes		134	\$ 4,913,475.00
Noon Routes		73	\$ 750,246.09	Noon Routes		73	\$ 929,843.39
TOTAL FIXED ROUTES			\$ 4,845,461.81	TOTAL FIXED ROUTES			\$ 5,843,318.39
CCEP AM/PM Routes		5.5	\$ 177,082.79	CCEP AM/PM ROUTES		5.5	\$ 230,280.11
CCEP OPTIONS			\$ 64,006.50	CCEP OPTIONS			\$ 82,537.50
Prince Charles AM/PM (Awasis)		6	\$ 242,287.32	Prince Charles AM/PM (Awasis)		6	\$ 283,486.02
Fuel Escalation			\$ 250,000.00				\$ 150,000.00
Total Expenditure			\$ 5,578,838.42	Total Expenditure			\$ 6,589,622.02
		GST Included	\$ 5,702,577.05			GST Included	\$ 6,735,779.83

* Rates do not include GST.

**2005-2006 ACTUAL AND 2006-2007 PROPOSED
SPECIAL NEEDS CHARTER BUS SERVICE EXPENDITURES**

Carriers	2005-2006 Actual Rates			2006-2007 Proposed Rates			
	Daily * Rates	Number of Students	Annual Cost (191 Days) **	Daily * Rates	Per Cent Increase	Number of Students	Projected Annual Cost (191 Days)
BRIGGS:							
B-1 Special Needs Fixed Route Daily Rate per Bus							
Literacy & Strategies				\$205.00	Per Bus	20	\$783,100.00
Transportation Zones 1 to 6							
C-1 & C-2							
In-Zone Ambulatory	\$13.65	1354	\$3,530,081.10	\$15.90	16.5 %	954	\$2,897,202.60
In-Zone Wheelchair	\$18.85	40	\$144,014.00	\$21.10	11.9 %	40	\$161,204.00
Out-Zone Ambulatory	\$14.88	499	\$1,418,197.92	\$17.13	15.1 %	399	\$1,305,460.17
Out-Zone Wheelchair	\$19.98	37	\$141,198.66	\$22.23	11.3 %	37	\$157,099.41
Total Mild/Moderate			\$5,233,491.68				
D-7							
Elves Child Development							
Ambulatory							
Wheelchair	\$20.39	19	\$73,995.31	\$23.94	17.4 %	19	\$86,878.26
Total		1949	\$5,307,486.99			1449	\$5,390,944.44
RED ARROW:							
E-1 - Early Education ***							
Ambulatory	\$15.25	461	\$1,342,777.75	\$17.25	13.1 %	461	\$1,518,879.75
Wheelchair	\$25.70	3	\$14,726.10	\$27.70	7.8 %	3	\$15,872.10
Total Early Education							
D-1 - Acad. King Ed./L.Y. Cairns ***							
Ambulatory	\$13.35	314	\$800,652.90	\$16.20	21.3 %	314	\$971,578.80
Wheelchair	\$25.70	6	\$29,452.20	\$28.95	12.6 %	6	\$33,176.70
D-2 - Tevie Miller & School for the Deaf ***							
Ambulatory	\$13.35	132	\$336,580.20	\$16.20	21.3 %	132	\$408,434.40
Wheelchair	\$25.70	1	\$4,908.70	\$28.95	12.6 %	1	\$5,529.45
D-3 - Interactions/Community Learning Skills ***							
Ambulatory	\$13.35	280	\$713,958.00	\$16.85	26.2 %	280	\$901,138.00
Wheelchair	\$25.70	11	\$53,995.70	\$28.95	12.6 %	11	\$60,823.95
D-5 - CASA/Spruce Avenue ***							
Ambulatory	\$14.54	15	\$41,657.10	\$17.25	18.6 %	15	\$49,421.25
Wheelchair	\$25.70	0	\$0.00	\$27.70	7.8 %	0	\$0.00
Eastwood/Others							
Ambulatory	\$14.54	28	\$77,759.92	\$17.25	18.6 %	28	\$92,253.00
Wheelchair	\$25.70	0	\$0.00	\$27.70	7.8 %	0	\$0.00
D-4 - Woodside/Special Circumstance ***							
Ambulatory	\$27.19	56	\$290,824.24	\$28.50	4.8 %	56	\$304,836.00
Wheelchair	\$25.70	0	\$0.00	\$27.70	7.8 %	0	\$0.00
Total Severe							
D-6 - Glenrose***							
Ambulatory	\$14.54	51	\$141,634.14	\$17.25	18.6 %	51	\$168,032.25
Wheelchair	\$25.70	0	\$0.00	\$27.70	7.8 %	0	\$0.00
Fuel Escalation			\$700,000.00				\$350,000.00
		1358				1358	
	2,491,423.10						
Total Expenditure		3,307	\$9,856,413.94			2,807	\$10,270,920.09
		GST Included	\$10,075,029.20			GST Included	\$10,498,729.10

* Rates do not include GST

*** District sites which draw students from across the city